Directions in Tax and Transfer Theory

Alan J. Auerbach
University of California, Berkeley
June 18, 2009
Overview

- Start with “accepted view” in public finance circa late-1960s
- Consider accumulation of theory and evidence since then, and the implications of these changes for the design of tax and transfer policy
The Traditional Setting

The Broad-Based Income Tax
The Broad-Based Income Tax

- Broad base permits low marginal tax rates and limits distortions associated with differences in tax rates on sources and uses of income
  - Limits reliance on tax expenditures
- High marginal tax rates not desirable, but acceptable at the top to achieve progressive tax burden
The Broad-Based Income Tax

- Progressivity achieved at low end largely through the transfer system
  - Arguments in favor of a negative income tax to reduce distortions of overlapping programs and in-kind redistribution
- Unit of taxation (individual vs. family) not uniform across countries
  - Income pooling advantages
  - Comparative distortions and family decision making process yet to be explored
The Corporate Income Tax

- Harberger model influential
  - Distortion of corporate-noncorporate capital allocation
  - Incidence on all capital
- Modigliani-Miller
  - Interest deductibility distorts debt-equity choice
- Can deal with both distortions through dividend relief (split-rate/imputation)
The Traditional Setting

Capital Gains and the Realization Principle
Capital Gains and the Realization Principle

- Not consistent with Haig-Simons income taxation (cash flows plus accretions to wealth)
- Understood to cause a “lock-in” effect
- But accepted as a practical way of dealing with unknown values of accruals and limited liquidity
- Provided an additional argument in support of corporate dividend relief
The Traditional Setting

Taxation of Cross-Border Income
Taxation of Cross-Border Income

- Setting: Bretton Woods and capital controls
- But still had cross-border investment and need for norms
- Capital export neutrality (national neutrality): a natural way to think about efficient allocation of a country’s capital
- Capital import neutrality: makes sense under some circumstances
Theory of Second Best

- A foundation for optimal tax theory
- An argument against piecemeal tax reform
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

Choice of Tax Base: Income or Consumption?
Choice of Tax Base: Income or Consumption?

- Theoretical developments
  - Atkinson-Stiglitz
  - Chamley-Judd

- Practical developments
  - Meade Committee
  - US Treasury *Blueprints*

- Design advances
  - Flat tax and X tax
Choice of Tax Base: Income or Consumption?

- But also recognition of limits to gains from adopting consumption tax
  - Transition relief and progressivity limit gains
  - How big is the tax on saving that the consumption tax eliminates?
  - New dynamic public finance and the potential gains from taxing capital income
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

The Progressive Rate Structure
The Progressive Rate Structure

- Mirrlees: even with strong preferences for redistribution, we will generally not want steeply increasing marginal tax rates at top of distribution.
- If individuals at the bottom don’t work, then a negative income tax looks good.
The Progressive Rate Structure

- But arguments for low top rates weaken as upper tail of the distribution becomes thicker and longer

- Several arguments against negative income tax
  - Gains from tagging
  - Gains from in-kind transfers
  - Gains from moving from unconditional transfers to EITC-type approach
The Progressive Rate Structure

- Also, labor supply elasticity (low) may not be the right one to look at in choosing marginal tax rates
- Taxable income elasticity seems higher
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

The Family Unit
Marginal tax rates on second earners can be very inefficient under joint taxation. Even lower marginal tax rates on second earner as first earner’s income rises. Within-family distribution of tax payments and transfers appears to matter. Resources not allocated via simple family-wide optimization.
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

Stepping Back from Second-Best Theory
Stepping Back from Second-Best Theory

- Not all distortions are equal
- Production distortions are to be avoided, because they add a gratuitous reduction in productivity to what other distortions can achieve (Diamond-Mirrlees)
- Under relatively weak assumptions, direct taxes are superior to indirect taxes for optimal tax systems (Atkinson-Stiglitz)
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

Rethinking the Realization Principle
Rethinking the Realization Principle

Distortions of realization-based taxation go well beyond the lock-in effect

- Tax arbitrage
- The additional distortions needed to support a realization-based system (e.g., loss limits)

We are in a better position to move toward accrual or accrual-type taxation

- More information and liquidity in markets
- Ideas on accrual-equivalent taxes
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

Corporate Sector Distortions
Corporate Sector Distortions

- Distortions may not be as large as previously thought
  - Borrowing can reduce investment wedge (Stiglitz)
  - Progressive rates can make equity tax-favored (Miller)
  - Dividend capitalization can reduce extra burden on dividends (new view)

- So, gains from dividend relief not as clear
Corporate Sector Distortions

As to incidence, some parts of corporate tax may not be shifted at all, but those that are may not land on all capital, but on less mobile factors.
Changes in Thinking, Evidence and Policy

Taxing Foreign-Source Income
Taxing Foreign-Source Income

- Two important factors for company taxation:
  - Companies can change residence
  - Companies can raise funds from other countries

- Implication: old norms may apply more to taxation of individuals than to taxation of companies
Taxing Foreign-Source Income

What is the right approach?

- New norms?
- Consider all relevant distortions for each type of tax system
- Go beyond traditional approaches of residence-based and source-based taxation?
Conclusions

- Much new information and, in some cases, evident policy responses
  - Second-best theory not as paralyzing
  - Flatter marginal tax rate schedules
- But, in many cases, a more complicated perspective
Conclusions

- How much should we rely on the consumption tax?
- How do families allocate resources?
- Who bears the corporate tax?
- How should we tax foreign-source income?
- How close can we come to realization-based taxation?